

|                                      | SEASONAL LEASE   |  | LONG-TERM LEASE  | CFM  | FOREST TICKET  | NTFP PERMIT   |
|--------------------------------------|--|--|--|--|--|---|
| Use of resources ( <i>de jure</i> )  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Payment in cash in advance or immediately after harvesting</li> <li>Lease agreement required</li> <li>Payment defined by type and volume of NTFP to be harvested</li> <li>Can be canceled if conditions and requirements of contract are not met</li> </ul>   |  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Payment in cash based on annual forest ticket fee</li> <li>Lease agreement registered in the <i>rayon</i> Gosregister</li> <li>Payment defined by various regulations for various types of use</li> <li>Can be cancelled if conditions and requirements of contract are not met</li> </ul>  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Income derived from use of forest resources linked to expenses made to maintain and improve forest area</li> <li>Lessee responsible for protection of its forest plots from diseases, fire and illegal use.</li> <li>Can be cancelled if conditions and requirements of contract are not met</li> </ul>   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Payment in cash based on volume and type of use</li> </ul>  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Payment in cash for specific resources and volume</li> </ul>   |
| Use ( <i>de facto</i> )              | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Used for harvesting of NTFP, such as pistachio and walnuts, fruits, and hay, less for arable land rent</li> <li>People from remote villages sublease land plots or are used as hired labor</li> <li>Involves additional work in the forest, such as pest collection or supplying <i>leskhoz</i> with seeds of collected fruits and nuts</li> <li>In some areas, users serve as labor paid by <i>leskhoz</i> in share of harvest</li> <li>People sublease land plots</li> <li>Fruits and nuts grown on seasonal lease plots are not well protected</li> <li><i>Leskhoz</i> calculate potential yields from the plot and define payment for lease based on 60% to 40% ratio with 60% staying with lessee.</li> <li>Payment often happens in kind (share of harvest). Because of immediate payment requirements, poor sell products right after harvesting, when price is lower</li> <li>Users do not pay taxes on this income</li> <li>Leasing and payment for lease only for years when NTFP yield is good</li> <li>Easiest way to obtain immediate benefits</li> <li>Security is low and does not provide secure tenure for user beyond season</li> <li>People often have no contracts</li> <li>Can be cancelled if conditions and requirements of the contract are not met or if condition of forest changes (vague definition in the FC)</li> </ul> |  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Used mostly for local grazing and farming, but people from remote communities and shepherds bring livestock from different places</li> <li>Subleasing is widespread</li> <li>Grazing and harvesting of NTFP in the National Park prohibited by the FC (FC Art 55)</li> <li>Users do not pay tax</li> <li>Payment relatively low</li> <li>Users can use other resources on same land plots without additional payment if in small quantities</li> <li>Almost all interviewed have contracts and some users even registered in Gosregister</li> </ul>                           | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Used for especially profitable forest resources, such as walnuts and pistachio plots, tourist attractions, trade locations near roads</li> <li>Only members of near-forest communities can access because of difficulty in protecting forests if they live far away</li> <li>Accountability mechanisms do not work; the 3 types of compliance commissions are dysfunctional</li> <li>Cost benefits calculated based on market prices, but cost of labor calculated based on the low official rates. Discrepancy makes CBFM arrangements unprofitable.</li> <li>All interviewed have contracts</li> <li>Right can be transferred to heir</li> <li>Right to part of the plot can be transferred to other people</li> <li>Sometimes <i>leskhoz</i> have made unilateral decisions to subdivide and allocate plots</li> <li>Tenure conditions are strict</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No instructions given on felling; people mostly do as they know</li> <li>People often use resources without forest tickets because they lack knowledge of system</li> <li>Confusion between permits for NTFP and forest tickets; people take long-term lease but provide payments based on forest tickets.</li> </ul>   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Only limited number of permits acquired in practice, mostly when export is intended since customs can request harvesting permits. In practice, people collect resources and supply them to either middlemen or companies, who then acquire permit for export.</li> </ul> |
|                                      | SEASONAL LEASE   | LONG-TERM LEASE  | CFM  | FOREST TICKET  | NTFP PERMIT  |   |
| Access ( <i>de jure</i> )            | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Application to <i>leskhoz</i></li> <li>Seasonal use</li> <li>Sublease is prohibited</li> </ul>  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Application to <i>leskhoz</i></li> <li>Terms range from five to 10 years, or up to 49 years</li> <li>Sublease is prohibited</li> <li>For cultivation, need to use local varieties</li> <li>For grazing, need to submit veterinary certificate on livestock number and health</li> </ul>   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Application to CBFM Commission</li> <li>Only local communities are eligible</li> <li>Preferences for people with experience in forestry, previous users</li> <li>Applicant should have sufficient human resources, land, and assets</li> <li>First lease is for five years and if all terms met, extension for 50 years</li> <li>Subleasing is allowed</li> <li>Area for CBFM limited in size: not bigger than 5 ha in walnut and fruit forests, 20 ha in mixed forests and 2 ha in riverside forests.</li> <li>Applicant should submit request for specific plot.</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Application to <i>leskhoz</i></li> <li>Seasonal only</li> </ul>   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Application to Territorial Department of Environment and Forest Ecosystem Development or to SAEPF for harvesting specific resources in specific number and volume</li> <li>Seasonal only</li> </ul>   |   |
| Issues in access ( <i>de facto</i> ) | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Where resources are scarce and competition intense, access is limited, especially for new users</li> <li>Preference informally given to previous users</li> <li>Perceived easier access to wealthier people, who bribe <i>leskhoz</i> staff, and/or those who are connected to <i>leskhoz</i></li> <li>People do not have information on resources/land plot availability for seasonal lease</li> </ul>   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Where resources are scarce access is limited</li> <li>All good land already allocated</li> <li>No accurate information about available lands for lease</li> <li>Perceived easier access to wealthier people, who bribe <i>leskhoz</i> staff, and/or those who are connected to <i>leskhoz</i></li> <li>People often sublease land; sublessees pay more</li> <li>No information on existing leases</li> </ul>              | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Community has no say in granting access to forest plots for households</li> <li>Lack of knowledge about available plots</li> <li>No incentives to form a group</li> <li>Inhibits access for women and poor, who lack knowledge, resources, and/or assets</li> <li>Demands a lot of labor to meet terms and conditions</li> </ul>  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Used mostly for harvesting of fallen trees</li> <li>Access to collection is difficult, e.g., in National Parks a park ranger must take pictures, make a report, and send it to SAEPF for judgment on what trees can be used for, then give forest officials the authority to distribute tickets for use. Process can take up to six months, rendering once-valuable timber source useless.</li> <li>People wait for one to two years to be able to buy timber or get forest tickets</li> <li>No information on availability of timber, fueling conflicts and leading to illegal felling</li> <li>Fuel wood collection happens mostly without acquiring tickets</li> </ul>   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Wide misunderstanding and confusion on access to these resources even among forestry officials. Some foresters interpret legislation that all permits for NTFP are issued by the <i>leskhoz</i>, except those which are to be exported</li> <li>Local communities do not know where and how to obtain permits, they also do not know when and if a permit is required, so they hunt and harvest medicinal plants and berries in commercial quantities without permits</li> <li>For many villagers, going to the oblast centers for permits is unaffordable</li> </ul> |   |
|                                      | SEASONAL LEASE   | LONG-TERM LEASE  | CFM  | FOREST TICKET  | NTFP PERMIT  |   |
| Major issues                         | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Users uninterested in sustainable harvesting methods and use of resources because of limited time span and insecurity of arrangements</li> <li><i>Leskhoz</i> not interested because revenue is unsustainable</li> <li>Does not support sustainable forest management</li> </ul>  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Negatively impacts ecosystems, i.e., cultivation of crops in the forest areas deteriorates soil, leads to loss of biodiversity, and brings diseases to forest ecosystems</li> <li>Fuels conflicts between community members and <i>leskhoz</i> with competition for grazing land leases, leads to illegal use</li> <li>Users have no incentives to preserve forest ecosystem and use its resources sustainably</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>CBFM as it is practiced leads to fragmentation of forest ecosystem and loss of biodiversity</li> <li>Users not restricted in types of use and often use forest land as arable land leading to loss of biodiversity and depletion of resources</li> <li>Not supportive for women and poor</li> </ul>   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>People cut trees illegally because there are no legal avenues; often cut healthy and valuable tree species</li> <li>People collect NTFP without use of sustainable methods and often deplete resources</li> </ul>   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Resources harvested illegally without payment. SAEPF loses significant source of revenue</li> <li>No incentives to use sustainable methods of harvesting; no control over user activities. <i>Leskhoz</i> does not receive any revenue from this type of use and thus does not monitor, leading to deterioration and depletion of forest resources</li> </ul>   |   |